

Exhibit D

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING
CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

1

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

November 13, 2024

Start: 2:20 p.m.

Recess: 3:24 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams, Speaker
Amanda Farías, Majority Leader

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana Ayala
Shaun Abreu
Joann Ariola
Alexa Avilés
Chris Banks
Joseph Borelli
Erik D. Bottcher
Justin L. Brannan
Gale A. Brewer
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Tiffany Cabán
David M. Carr
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Eric Dinowitz
Oswald Feliz
James F. Gennaro
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Shahana Hanif
Kamillah M. Hanks

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

2

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (continued)

Robert F. Holden
Crystal Hudson
Rita C. Joseph
Shekar Krishnan
Linda Lee
Farrah N. Louis
Kristy Marmorato
Christopher Marte
Julie Menin
Francisco P. Moya
Mercedes Narcisse
Sandy Nurse
Chi A. Ossé
Vickie Paladino
Keith Powers
Lincoln Restler
Kevin C. Riley
Carlina Rivera
Yusef Salaam
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Lynn C. Schulman
Althea V. Stevens
Sandra Ung
Inna Vernikov
Nantasha M. Williams
Julie Won
Kalman Yeger
Susan Zhuang

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

3

A P P E A R A N C E S

INVOCATION DELIVERED BY: Rev. Dr. Frankco
Harris, Mt. Olivet Baptist Church of Hollis
located at 202-03 Hollis Avenue, St. Albans, NY
11412

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

4

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Check one, two. This is
3 a pre-recorded sound test for today's Stated Meeting.
4 Today's date is November 13, 2024. It's being
5 recorded by Michael Leonardo in the Council Chambers.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: At this time, please
7 place all electronic devices to vibrate.

8 Madam Majority Leader.

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Good afternoon,
10 and welcome to the Stated Meeting of November 13,
11 2024. I am Majority Leader Amanda Farías, and I'd
12 like to thank you for joining us.

13 If you would like to follow along, the
14 agenda for today's meeting is posted on our website.

15 On behalf of the Body, I welcome the
16 members of the public who have joined us today.

17 During Stated Meetings, only Members of
18 the Council may speak. Members of the public shall
19 remain silent. If you wish to express your support of
20 any remarks, you may make the silent approval
21 gesture.

22 I want to remind my Colleagues that
23 decorum is to be respected at all times. Insulting
24 each other is not appropriate. All remarks are to be
25 addressed to the Chair, and Members shall not speak

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

5

2 unless recognized by the Chair. It is essential that
3 even if we disagree, we treat each other with
4 respect.

5 CITY CLERK: Please join us for the Pledge
6 of Allegiance.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise!

8 ALL: [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE]

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Roll call.

10 CITY CLERK: Abreu.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Present.

12 CITY CLERK: Ariola.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Here.

14 CITY CLERK: Avilés.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Presente.

16 CITY CLERK: Ayala.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Here.

18 CITY CLERK: Banks.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Presente.

20 CITY CLERK: Bottcher.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Present.

22 CITY CLERK: Brannan.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

24 CITY CLERK: Brewer.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 6

2 CITY CLERK: Brooks-Powers. Cabán.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Here.

4 CITY CLERK: Carr.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Here.

6 CITY CLERK: De La Rosa.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Here.

8 CITY CLERK: Brooks-Powers.

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: She identified
10 herself as present earlier.

11 CITY CLERK: Thank you. Dinowitz.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Here.

13 CITY CLERK: Feliz. Gennaro.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.

15 CITY CLERK: Gutiérrez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Presente.

17 CITY CLERK: Hanif.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Here.

19 CITY CLERK: Hanks.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Present.

21 CITY CLERK: Holden.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

23 CITY CLERK: Hudson.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Present.

25 CITY CLERK: Joseph.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

7

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Present.

3 CITY CLERK: Krishnan.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Here.

5 CITY CLERK: Lee.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Here.

7 CITY CLERK: Louis.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present.

9 CITY CLERK: Marmorato.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Present.

11 CITY CLERK: Marte.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Present.

13 CITY CLERK: Mealy. Menin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Here.

15 CITY CLERK: Moya.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.

17 CITY CLERK: Narcisse.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Present.

19 CITY CLERK: Nurse.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Present.

21 CITY CLERK: Ossé.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Present.

23 CITY CLERK: Paladino.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Present.

25 CITY CLERK: Powers.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

8

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

3 CITY CLERK: Restler.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Here.

5 CITY CLERK: Riley. Rivera.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

7 CITY CLERK: Salaam.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Present.

9 CITY CLERK: Salamanca.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

11 CITY CLERK: Sanchez.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Present.

13 CITY CLERK: Schulman.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Here.

15 CITY CLERK: Stevens.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Here.

17 CITY CLERK: Ung.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Present.

19 CITY CLERK: Vernikov.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Present.

21 CITY CLERK: Williams.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Present.

23 CITY CLERK: Won.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Present.

25 CITY CLERK: Yeger.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

9

2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

3 CITY CLERK: Zhuang.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Here.

5 CITY CLERK: Borelli. Borelli.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

7 CITY CLERK: Farías.

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Present.

9 CITY CLERK: Speaker Adams.

10 SPEAKER ADAMS: Present.

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. We

12 will now have today's invocation, which will be

13 delivered by Reverend Dr. Frankco Harris of Mount

14 Olivet Baptist Church of Hollis, which is located at

15 202-03 Hollis Avenue in Queens.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise!

17 REVEREND DR. FRANKCO HARRIS: Lord, on

18 today, we thank you for another day that we've never

19 seen before and we will never see again. Help us to

20 take advantage of the time that you have given to us

21 and make the world that we live in a better place. We

22 ask that you will be with our City leaders and

23 officials as they make decisions and policies for the

24 people of this great city. We ask that you meet the

25 needs of this city and multiply our resources, that

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

10

2 there is no lack in any area. We also ask that you
3 give us good health, abundant finances, and astute
4 cognitive ability to navigate the vicissitudes of
5 life. We acknowledge that we are better together and
6 we strive to live in peace and harmony with one
7 another. Help us to be a support system for one
8 another when we are in need and to share our surplus
9 with individuals that may lack. Thank you that our
10 best days are ahead of us and we need shades to see
11 this bright future. The Lord bless thee and keep
12 thee. The Lord make his face to shine upon thee and
13 be gracious unto thee. The Lord lift up his
14 countenance upon thee and give thee peace. And
15 everyone said amen.

16 ALL: Amen.

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. I
18 would now ask Council Member Nantasha Williams to
19 spread the invocation on the record.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,
21 Majority Leader. It is my honor to introduce a
22 remarkable leader and community servant, Pastor
23 Reverend Dr. Frankco Harris of Mount Olivet Baptist
24 Church in St. Albans, who is originally from
25 Montgomery, Alabama, the birthplace of the Civil

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

11

2 Rights Movement, was raised with strong faith by his
3 parents, Deacon and Missionary Eddie F. Harris.

4 Pastor Harris now calls Mount Olivet Baptist Church
5 in Hollis, Queens home. A talented musician, Dr.

6 Harris received a full scholarship to Alabama A and M
7 University, where he excelled in music and

8 performance. Yet feeling a divine calling to

9 ministry, he went on to earn advanced degrees in

10 religious studies and worship, including a doctor of

11 ministry. His electrifying preaching and dedication

12 have grown Mount Olivet in membership and spirit. In

13 addition to his pastoral work, Dr. Harris founded

14 FAME, Frankco's Academy for Music Education, to

15 promote music education for inner-city youth

16 alongside his wife, Valerie, a New York City teacher

17 and their two children. He continues to uplift and

18 inspire the community. He's also a constituent, and

19 we love Mount Olivet Baptist Church as they continue

20 to be a pillar of the Southeast Queens community

21 under his dutiful leadership so please join me in

22 welcoming Pastor Reverend Dr. Frankco Harris as he

23 leads us in today's invocation, or as he led us, and

24 with that, I will make a motion to spread today's

25 invocation on the record.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 12

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: We will now have
3 the adoption of minutes by Council Member Chi Ossé.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: I make a motion that
5 the minutes of the Stated Meeting of November 13,
6 2024, be adopted as printed.

7 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Messages and
8 Papers from the Mayor.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: M79, Corporation Council
10 appointment.

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: Rules, Privileges, and
12 Elections.

13 Communication from City, County, and
14 Borough Offices.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Petitions and
17 Communications.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

19 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Land Use Call-
20 Ups.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. We
23 will now have Communication from Speaker Adrienne
24 Adams.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

13

2 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Madam
3 Majority Leader, and good afternoon, everyone.

4 Last week, voters across our city, state,
5 and nation took to the polls to make their voices
6 heard. It's important that we acknowledge the real
7 fear and anxiety that people are feeling about the
8 results of the presidential election. While
9 respecting the results of an election and the
10 peaceful transfer of power, we must remain vigilant
11 to prevent the potential negative impact a second
12 Trump presidency could mean for the protection and
13 progress of civil rights. While I am disappointed by
14 the outcome of the election, we remain prepared to
15 protect New Yorkers and our diverse city. Our city
16 has consistently persevered in the face of adversity,
17 and this will be no different. We emerge stronger by
18 standing together and, by working to protect each
19 other, we can safeguard our rights and our shared
20 values. Let me also say this. New York City is a city
21 of immigrants. We are home to rich immigrant
22 communities who built our city and power its economy,
23 and New York City will continue to be a beacon for
24 them. We are also proud to be a safe haven for
25 abortion and reproductive care, which New Yorkers

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 14

2 affirmed by overwhelmingly approving Proposition 1,
3 the Equal Rights Amendment. With their vote, New
4 Yorkers enshrined our reproductive and civil rights
5 into the State Constitution, ensuring that access to
6 life-saving healthcare is protected in New York.

7 It is also noteworthy that Proposals 2
8 through 5 passed with the narrowest margin of any New
9 York City ballot proposal in at least 15 years. The
10 Mayor's recent Charter Revision Commission composed
11 solely of his appointees rushed the process to put
12 Proposals 2 through 6 on the ballot without any
13 meaningful input or consideration from New Yorkers.
14 This hasty process undermined the public's ability to
15 engage with these proposals then used misleading
16 language in posing the questions to voters. New
17 Yorkers deserve more transparency and respect for
18 democracy than was characterized by those proposals
19 and the Commission that created them. My bill to
20 establish a Charter Revision Commission is aimed at
21 restoring these democratic norms that were undermined
22 last summer as well as the trust in City government
23 that has been harmed by the events of the past
24 several months. Local elections matter and have a
25 profound impact on our lives. I thank New Yorkers for

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

15

2 getting out to vote and will always encourage all of
3 our neighbors who can vote to exercise that right.

4 The Council will continue to prioritize
5 the protection and strengthening of democracy, civil
6 rights, and safety in our city, ensuring the dignity
7 of all New Yorkers is upheld as we continue working
8 towards a more equitable future for all.

9 On October 24th, a 56-year-old woman
10 passed away in a deadly fire in Council Member
11 Williams' District. A 64-year-old man was also killed
12 after a fire broke out at NYCHA's Frederick Douglass
13 Houses in Council Member Abreu's District. That same
14 day, another fatal fire took place in Council Member
15 Feliz's District, leaving a 34-year-old man dead and
16 another one injured. This marks the fifth death due
17 to a lithium-ion battery fire this year. While the
18 Council has passed key legislation to regulate the
19 licensing and sales of lithium-ion batteries, we know
20 more must be done to prevent these fires and achieve
21 the safety that New Yorkers deserve. Earlier this
22 month, there was yet another fatal fire, taking the
23 lives of two New Yorkers in Council Member Williams'
24 District. Losing someone you love is devastating. My
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

16

2 prayers are with all of the grieving families,
3 neighbors, and victims, and friends of the victims.

4 November is Puerto Rican Heritage Month.

5 I want to honor the many contributions and
6 accomplishments of our Puerto Rican communities who
7 helped shape our city into what it is today. Join us
8 for our Puerto Rican Heritage Chamber event next
9 Monday, November 18th, in honor of the late and
10 beloved Carlos Carillo Higgins. Carlos served the
11 Council for 25 years, joining as a Member of Central
12 Staff in 1999 and working for every Speaker in the
13 city's history. He was the heart of our Community
14 Engagement Division and most recently served as Co-
15 Director of the Community Outreach Unit. Carlos was
16 deeply proud of his beloved Puerto Rico, and he
17 channeled that love into improving his community.
18 Carlos lived by the code that we should strive to
19 lead a place better than we found it, and he always
20 did just that.

21 November is also National Native American
22 Heritage Month when we uplift the history and
23 cultures of Indigenous peoples. It's critical that we
24 recognize that we are currently in the homeland of
25 the Lenape. As a city and country, we must commit to

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

17

2 meeting the needs of our Indigenous communities and
3 confronting the disparities they continue to face.

4 I want to acknowledge November also as
5 National Alzheimer's Disease Awareness Month. This
6 disease affects more than 6 million Americans. It's
7 critical that we recognize them and all families and
8 caregivers who support their well-being. Thank you to
9 our Committee Chair on Aging, Council Member Crystal
10 Hudson, for all you do to advance the care for older
11 adults in our city.

12 On November 11th, we observed Veterans
13 Day. I thank all of our veterans for their widespread
14 contributions to our country. My father, my father-
15 in-law, and my husband all served in the United
16 States Air Force, so this is a very important day for
17 my own family, as it is for all families of veterans.

18 November 19th is World Day of Remembrance
19 for Road Traffic Victims, when we remember the
20 victims of traffic violence. We lose too many
21 residents to preventable traffic crashes each year,
22 which underscores the importance of the work ahead to
23 make our streets safer for pedestrians, cyclists,
24 drivers, and all road users alike.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

18

2 On November 20th, our nation will observe
3 Trans Day of Remembrance, which honors those we have
4 lost to anti-trans violence. As a city, we remain
5 focused on supporting and uplifting all LGBTQIA+ New
6 Yorkers.

7 Finally, I want to wish a happy birthday
8 to Council Members Kevin Riley and Keith Powers, who
9 share a birthday on the 16th, happy birthday, and
10 they're sitting together.

11 CHAMBERS: [APPLAUSE]

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Now, let's move on to our
13 stated agenda.

14 First, we'll vote on the following
15 Finance items. Resolution 627, sponsored by Council
16 Member Justin Brannan, will set the date, place, and
17 time for a public hearing on legislation to increase
18 the annual expenditure for nine Business Improvement
19 Districts; Resolution 630, sponsored by Council
20 Member Keith Powers, will set the date, place, and
21 time for a public hearing on legislation to increase
22 the annual expenditure for the Madison Avenue
23 Business Improvement District and amend the
24 District's plans method of assessment; a Pre-
25 Considered Resolution sponsored by Council Member

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

19

2 Justin Brannan, authorizing a 40-year Article XI tax
3 exemption for the preservation of seven affordable
4 senior housing buildings in Council Member Rivera's,
5 Menin's, and Powers' Districts; a Pre-Considered
6 Resolution sponsored by Council Member Justin
7 Brannan, authorizing a 40-year Article XI tax
8 exemption for the preservation of one HDFC co-op
9 building in Council Member Abreu's District; and a
10 Transparency Resolution approving new designations
11 and changes of certain organizations receiving
12 funding in the expense budget.

13 Next, we will vote on the Mayor's
14 appointments of Michael Espiritu and Vanessa
15 Rodriguez as Directors of the New York City Health
16 and Hospitals Corporation.

17 We will also vote on the following Land
18 Use item. The Council will approve La Catrina's
19 application for a revocable consent to operate a
20 sidewalk cafe in Council Member Holden's District.

21 Today, we will also vote on the following
22 pieces of legislation. Resolution 441, sponsored by
23 Council Member Kristy Marmorato, would designate
24 March 29th annually as Vietnam Veterans Day in the
25 City of New York in honor of the bravery and

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

20

2 sacrifice of the Americans who served and in
3 recognition of the past and present dedication of
4 their families and their caregivers. We thank you to
5 our Staff Member Regina Paul.

6 Resolution 95, sponsored by Council
7 Member Shahana Hanif, would call upon the New York
8 City Department of Education to consult with faith-
9 based organizations to develop and provide all grade
10 levels with a curriculum that focuses on religious
11 diversity and to provide professional development
12 focused on religious diversity for teachers, staff,
13 and administrators; Resolution 13, sponsored by
14 Council Member Rita Joseph, would designate the
15 second Friday in March annually as Social and
16 Emotional Learning Day in the City of New York. We
17 thank our staff member Chloe Rivera.

18 Introduction 663-A, sponsored by Council
19 Member Erik Bottcher, would empower the Department of
20 Transportation to set standards for the size, shape,
21 and materials of news racks. This bill would also
22 restrict news racks from being placed too closely to
23 City infrastructure located on sidewalks. We thank
24 our Staff Members Mark Chen and David Lowenstein.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

21

2 Introduction 130-A, sponsored by Council
3 Member Gale Brewer, would expand the Council's
4 organic waste diversion efforts, specifically in
5 parks, by requiring the Department of Parks and
6 Recreation to establish composting facilities for
7 plant waste within at least two parks in each borough
8 by July 2026 and at least three parks in each borough
9 by July 2027 and at least five parks in each borough
10 by July 2028. We thank our Staff Members Chris
11 Sartori and Patrick Mulvihill.

12 Next, Introduction 1088-A, my bill to
13 establish a Charter Revision Commission that
14 prioritizes improving City government and
15 transparency. The Commission would consist of 17
16 members appointed by the Speaker, Mayor, Public
17 Advocate, Comptroller, and all five Borough
18 Presidents. Registered lobbyists would be ineligible
19 to serve on the Commission. The Commission would be
20 required to conduct an extensive outreach campaign to
21 solicit ideas from civic and community leaders and
22 encourage the public to participate in the hearing
23 process. In contrast to the Mayor's Commission that
24 rushed completion of the process in less than two
25 months, the proposed legislation would provide at

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

22

2 least eight months for the Commission's work before
3 its earliest submission of proposals for a general
4 election in 2025 and up to 20 months for the 2026
5 general election. Through an open, transparent, and
6 inclusive process, it will actively seek input from
7 across communities ensuring that proposed changes to
8 the City Charter, our Constitution, reflect the needs
9 and priorities of the public. This Commission will
10 have the time and mandate to focus on the long-term
11 well-being of the entire city, not the short-term
12 political gains of any current officeholder. The main
13 goal of this Commission is to rebuild New Yorker's
14 confidence in City government and re-establish model
15 standards for these commissions. We thank our Staff
16 Members, Jayasri Ganapathy, David Seitzer, and Erica
17 Cohen.

18 Introduction 360-A, also known as the
19 FAIR Act, sponsored by Council Member Chi Ossé, would
20 ensure that renters are not forced to pay a fee for
21 the services of a real estate broker they did not
22 hire. It would prohibit brokers from passing their
23 fee onto tenants when the broker is exclusively
24 representing the landlord's interests. Landlords or
25 their agents would be required to disclose the fees

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

23

2 that the tenant must pay in their listings and rental
3 agreements. The Department of Consumer and Worker
4 Protection would enforce this bill and would conduct
5 education and outreach. Any person who violates this
6 bill would be subject to a civil penalty or civil
7 action. We thank our staff members, Rachel Cordero,
8 David Seitzer, Natalie Meltzer, and Sarah Swaine.

9 Thank you very much for your attention,
10 Colleagues. Now I turn it back over to our Majority
11 Leader.

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you,
13 Speaker Adams.

14 We will now move into Discussion of
15 General Orders, and I'd like to recognize Council
16 Member Brewer followed by Ossé.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very
18 much. I'm calling your attention to number 130-A,
19 which is on the agenda today. It will establish
20 composting facilities in city parks to manage plant
21 waste sustainably, modeled after the Riverside Park
22 composting facility, which is so fabulous that people
23 come just to see it, and it is powered by solar. This
24 initiative aims to reduce the amount of organic waste
25 sent to landfills, improve soil health, and decrease

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

24

2 greenhouse gas emissions, create green jobs, because
3 they'll have to have jobs to operate the sites. The
4 implementation plan calls for at least one compost
5 facility in two parks per borough by July '26, one
6 compost facility in three parks in each borough by
7 July '27, one compost facility in five parks in July
8 '28. I definitely want to thank Parks Chair Shekar
9 Krishnan, the Compost Coalition, like Eric Goldstein
10 of NRDC, Justin Green of Big Reuse, and my staff,
11 certainly Shula Puder and Cynthia Hornig, and Council
12 Legislation Staff, Patrick Mulvihill and Chris
13 Sartori, and I say, go compost. Thank you very much.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Thank you. I'd
15 like to recognize Council Member Ossé followed by
16 Bottcher.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you, Majority
18 Leader. I would like to speak about Intro. 360-A, or
19 the FAIR Act. Today is the culmination of over a year
20 and a half of work. My team and I collaborated with
21 renters, Council Members, lawyers, workers, brokers,
22 and so many more individuals and groups to create
23 this piece of legislation. We built a coalition
24 spanning the five boroughs who recognize the gravity
25 of the housing crisis we face and are committed to

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

25

2 finally bringing fairness to apartment and rental
3 expenses. The FAIR Act is simple. It requires that
4 whoever hires a broker in a rental transaction,
5 whether landlord or tenant, pays the broker fee. In
6 too many millions of cases across our city and
7 decades of history, tenants have been forced to hand
8 over thousands of dollars in fees to brokers they
9 never hired nor wanted. The harm of this practice
10 cannot be overstated. Families seeking to grow forgo
11 having children because they can't afford to move
12 into a larger place. Children aging out of their
13 parents' homes are pushed into different
14 neighborhoods or even cities because they can't
15 afford to rent an apartment in their own community.
16 Workers are unable to live near their jobs. Victims
17 are unable to leave domestic abuse. People are unable
18 to bring their talent and drive to our amazing city
19 because of forced broker fees. Today, we end that
20 cruel and archaic practice. I want to thank Speaker
21 Adams as well as advocacy groups, unions, my
22 Colleagues, and everyone else who got us to this
23 moment. Of course, Sarah Swaine, Legislative Counsel,
24 Natalie Meltzer, Policy Analyst, Rachel Codero. In
25 addition to that, today is a win for the people of

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

26

2 New York as we make official what has long been
3 common sense. You get what you pay for and you pay
4 for what you get. I urge all my Colleagues to vote
5 yes on this bill.

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. I'd
7 like to recognize Council Member Bottcher.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Today, we're
9 passing legislation to address those plastic sidewalk
10 newspaper boxes. This is something that New Yorkers,
11 we've got a love-hate relationship with them in true
12 New York fashion. We love having easy access to free
13 periodicals on the sidewalk. We don't love that
14 they're frequently neglected, vandalized, broken,
15 filled with garbage, tipped over, causing sidewalk
16 congestion, and just plain eyesores, and many of them
17 aren't even for newspapers, but promotions for
18 commercial enterprises. Until now, the City hasn't
19 had many tools to address this issue because the
20 current regulations don't empower them to. So today,
21 we're voting on City Council legislation that'll
22 clarify and strengthen the regulations regarding the
23 siting, design, and maintenance of sidewalk news
24 racks. This will empower the DOT to develop standards
25 regarding where they're placed, installed, design

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

27

2 standards, size, shape, and appearance. It also
3 clarifies that they shouldn't be used just for
4 advertising and promotional purposes. The owners of
5 the news racks will have to affix contact information
6 so we know who to call when they're not being
7 properly maintained. I want to thank Speaker Adams,
8 Majority Whip Selvena Brooks-Powers, Sandra Ung, the
9 prime co-sponsor of this legislation, and all the
10 organizations and residents who came forward to help
11 support this legislation. Together, we'll keep
12 working to improve life for New Yorkers in ways large
13 and small.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. Seeing
15 no one else signed up to speak. Report of Special
16 Committees.

17 CITY CLERK: None.

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Reports of
19 Standing Committees.

20 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on
21 Consumer and Worker Protection, Intro 360-A, Rental
22 Real Estate Broker Fees.

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on
24 General Orders.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 28

2 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on
3 Finance, Resos 627 and 630, Business Improvement
4 Districts.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

6 CITY CLERK: Pre-Considered Reso. 641,
7 Organization Funding.

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

9 CITY CLERK: Pre-Considered LU 189 and
10 Reso. 646 and Pre-Considered LU 190 and Reso. 647,
11 Tax Exemptions.

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

13 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on
14 Governmental Operations, State and Federal
15 Legislation, Intro. 1088-A, Charter Revision
16 Commission.

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on
18 General Orders.

19 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on
20 Land Use, LU 161 through LU 172 on page 6, Various
21 Applications.

22 SPEAKER ADAMS: Approved with
23 modifications and referred to the City Planning
24 Commission pursuant to Section 1970 of the New York
25 City Charter.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

29

2 CITY CLERK: LU 188 and Reso. 648,
3 Sidewalk Cafe.

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

5 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on
6 Parks and Recreation, Intro. 130-A, Composting
7 Facilities.

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on
9 General Orders.

10 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on
11 Rules, Privileges, and Elections, Pre-Considered
12 Reso. 643, Approving the Designation for Appointment
13 of Michael Espiritu, Health and Hospitals
14 Corporation.

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

16 CITY CLERK: Pre-Considered Reso. 644,
17 Approving the Designation for Appointment of Vanessa
18 Rodriguez, Health and Hospitals Corporation.

19 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

20 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on
21 Transportation and Infrastructure, Intro. 663-A, News
22 Rack Requirements.

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on
24 General Orders.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 30

2 I now ask that the Clerk take a roll call
3 vote on all of the items coupled on today's General
4 Orders calendar.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Joseph.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Aye on all.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Abreu.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ariola.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Aye on all with
11 the exception of 360-A for which I am a no.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Avilés.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Aye on all.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ayala.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
17 you. Banks.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Bottcher.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Brannan.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Brewer.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye on all.
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 31

2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Brooks-
3 Powers. On behalf of Majority Whip Brooks-Powers, I
4 will disclose for her, I am disclosing for the record
5 that the NYC Department of Education is funded in the
6 Transparency Resolution we are adopting, and my child
7 and sister are associated with that entity.

8 Council Member Brooks-Powers. We'll come
9 back to Council Member Brooks-Powers.

10 Cabán. Carr.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: I vote no on Intro.
12 360-A and aye on the rest.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: De La
14 Rosa.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
17 you. Dinowitz.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Feliz.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Permission takes
21 for my vote. Granted maybe, maybe not. Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission
24 granted.
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

32

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you. Thank
3 you so much. Proud to vote aye on, especially proud
4 to vote yes on the broker bill, a bill that is based
5 on good policy and based on common sense. Anytime we
6 talk about any industry, an individual selling or
7 renting a product, generally it's that individual
8 doing the renting or the selling of that product who
9 would pay for the advertisement of that product. How
10 is it possible that in the City of New York, a city
11 where we're clearly in a well-documented housing
12 crisis, we're going to put additional obstacles on
13 those that want to rent? We need to make sure that we
14 create a better housing system for everyone,
15 including for low-income families that are struggling
16 to find an apartment. For that reason and for many
17 other reasons, proud to vote aye on that broker bill
18 and on all, and I want to congratulate Council Member
19 Ossé on getting that to the finish line.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
21 you. Council Member Brooks-Powers. Once again, I'll
22 read her disclosure. I'm disclosing for the record,
23 NYC Department of Education is funded in the
24 Transparency Resolution we are adopting, and my child

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

33

2 and sister are associated with that entity. Council
3 Member Brooks-Powers, how do you vote?

4 For the record, Majority Whip Brooks-
5 Powers has signaled her affirmative vote remotely.
6 Thank you, Council Member.

7 Gennaro.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Madam Majority
9 Leader, I wish to speak on my vote.

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission
11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you. I'm a
13 proud co-sponsor of the Speaker's bill, 1088-A. I
14 wish to be associated with her good remarks on that
15 bill. This will be an opportunity to right a really
16 horrendous wrong, and I urge everyone to support this
17 good bill and to be vigilant as we go forward to
18 protect the integrity of this institution. Thank you
19 very much. Oh, and I vote aye on all.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
21 you. Gutiérrez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: I vote aye.
23 Congrats to all my Colleagues, especially Council
24 Member Ossé. Thank you.

25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

34

2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
3 you. Hanif.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Aye on all.
5 Congrats, Chi.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Hanks.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Aye on all and
8 congratulations, Council Member Ossé.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Holden.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Hudson.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Aye on all.

13 Congratulations to Council Member Ossé and to all New
14 Yorkers who will now avoid paying a broker fee that
15 they didn't hire a broker for.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Krishnan.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Aye on all.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Lee.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Aye on all.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Louis.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN:

23 Marmorato.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: I vote aye on
25 all with the exception of 360-A.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 35

2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Marte.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: I vote aye on all.

4 Congrats, Chi.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Mealy.

6 Menin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Moya.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank

11 you. Narcisse.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Permission to

13 explain my vote?

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission

15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I want to say

17 thank you, thank you, Majority Leader, and thank you,

18 Madam Speaker. 1088, people probably don't understand

19 why I clap because it's so important to have all our

20 community involved in the process of democracy.

21 Democracy is not one person. I came from a country

22 that was still struggling for democracy and, when I

23 see democracy, I enjoy it, every second of it. I

24 probably can overdo it at times. I was on the street

25 to educate people. People need to be part of

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 36

2 government. We have it right here because that's the
3 way we have to live our lives and for all the Staff
4 that worked on it, that pushing us to do it every
5 day, remind us that we are here for the people, for
6 the work of the people so I want to vote aye and
7 congratulation to all my Colleagues and Madam
8 Speaker.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
10 you. Nurse.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: I vote aye.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ossé.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Permission to
14 explain my vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Aye on all, and I
18 want to add that today is a win for all New Yorkers
19 and proof of what progressive governance can
20 accomplish. Finally, after over a year and a half of
21 work, after a seemingly endless fight against a
22 relentless and ruthless real estate lobby hell-bent
23 on fleecing the people of our city, we passed the
24 FAIR Act. Housing is the largest cost for New Yorkers
25 and our number one political concern. For too many

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

37

2 decades, tenants have been forced to hand over
3 thousands of dollars and fees to a broker they never
4 hired or asked for, straining their budgets and
5 restricting their freedom of movement. This paradigm
6 has always been unacceptable, and now we vote for it
7 to end. This victory did not come easy. Again, we
8 built a coalition of labor unions, advocacy groups,
9 electeds, New Yorkers of all backgrounds and, yes,
10 even brokers. We mobilized the people through a
11 social media campaign that garnered millions of
12 impressions, providing and proving the potential for
13 a new and more democratic era of mass politics and we
14 won through unity. I want to thank Speaker Adams,
15 Jeremy John, and Council Member Shaun Abreu and
16 Oswald Feliz for their early belief in this project
17 and all of my Colleagues in this Body. I also want to
18 thank the unions, groups, and every organization
19 whose advocacy made this possible and, of course, I
20 wouldn't be here without my staff. I want to thank my
21 former Chief-of-Staff Naomi Hopkins who was there
22 when we launched this campaign and my current Chief-
23 of-Staff Arlean Gillin who is here to finish it.
24 Thank you to my Legislative Director, May
25 Vutrapongvatana, who shepherded this bill through the

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 38

2 Council, and thank you to my Director of
3 Communications, Elijah Fox, who crafted and executed
4 the communications, political, and social media
5 strategy that won this fight against a million-dollar
6 lobby and for the people of our city. We fought for
7 New York and today we win for New York. This one's
8 for you. Thank you so much.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
10 you. Paladino.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I'd like to
12 explain my vote.

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: So ordered.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Thank you. I
15 vote aye on all except for 360-A, and here's my
16 explanation. Let's give another side to 360-A. We
17 talk a lot here about the affordability crisis. Yet,
18 here we are with yet another law that will only make
19 life more expensive in the end. These fees aren't
20 going anywhere. They are now just going to be built
21 into rents, and rents will go up as a result, all
22 while hurting small business people in this city who
23 make their living helping tenants find housing. This
24 bill will force thousands of housing units to go
25 unadvertised, greatly limiting transparency and

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

39

2 cutting the general public off from potential housing
3 opportunities. Because new units will not be
4 advertised and the limitations placed on them by this
5 new law, potential tenants won't have the leverage to
6 negotiate the best possible deal between competing
7 brokers. This will fundamentally break the rental
8 market, driving up prices and limiting availability,
9 and then in a few more years we'll all sit here again
10 and wonder why housing is even more expensive and try
11 to pass yet another dumb command economic solution
12 destined to fail this city. At what point is everyone
13 here going to realize that we're only going to make
14 things worse. I sincerely hope that the real estate
15 industry sues to have this law stopped. Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Cabán.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER Cabán: Congratulations to
18 Council Member Ossé, and I vote aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank You
20 Council Member. Powers.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Restler.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Big (INAUDIBLE)
24 and gratitude to Council Member Ossé for his
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 40

2 leadership. Proud to vote aye on all. It's a good day
3 for tenants in New York City.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Riley.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Just want to state
6 for the record on the Transparency Resolution, both
7 of my daughters attend a DOE school, and I vote aye
8 on all and congratulations to my brother, Council
9 Member Ossé.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Rivera.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.
12 Congratulations to my Colleagues.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Salaam.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: I vote aye on all.
15 Congratulations.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN:
17 Salamanca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Sanchez.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Permission to
21 explain my vote.

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission
23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you, Madam
25 Leader. I just want to say there is a saying in

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 41

2 Spanish that Translates to that person who invites,
3 pays, and that is what this bill is doing (SPEAKING
4 SPANISH) Congratulations to Council Member Ossé. You
5 really created possibility here, and it's a lesson to
6 all of us. We can build and do a lot for New Yorkers
7 in our city. Congratulations. I vote aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Schulman.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Aye on all.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Stevens.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I would like to
12 disclose for the record that my daughter attends CUNY
13 and works at New York Presbyterian Hospital, and I
14 would like to vote aye and all and congratulations,
15 Chi, on an amazing bill that I do not believe is
16 dumb. Thanks.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ung.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Vernikov.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: No on 360-A and
21 aye on the rest.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Williams.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote aye and
24 congrats, Council Member Ossé. I know you worked
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 42

2 really hard to get this done, and I'm very proud of
3 you.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Won.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Aye on all.

6 Congratulations, Chi Ossé.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Yeger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,
9 may I be excused to explain my vote?

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission
11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very
13 much. Sometimes what might seem like a fair and
14 reasonable law, a good idea, a commonsense concept is
15 nonetheless outside the purview of this institution
16 and this Body adopt, and that happens because we are
17 a creature and a creation of the State of New York,
18 and we don't have the authority as much as we would
19 like it to regulate every single part of this city,
20 notwithstanding the fact that we are the City's
21 Legislature. This is a particular example of that.
22 New York State Law, the Real Property Law, Article
23 12a regulates brokers, regulates the fees that they
24 accept, regulates the method by which they can accept
25 commissions, regulates their licensure. The State has

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

43

2 opined on this topic. They've said that they will
3 control this topic. That takes us out of the mix. It
4 doesn't mean that we can't propose a good idea. It
5 just means we don't have the authority legally to
6 adopt it and, over time, over the last several years,
7 and this time will soon come to an end, I have opined
8 on this topic and sometimes the courts have agreed
9 with me and sometimes they haven't, and we don't know
10 what will happen, but I like to err on the side of my
11 reading of the law and on 1088, I can't agree that
12 the Council has the legal authority to pass this bill
13 so I vote no on Intro. 360. I also vote no on Intro.
14 1088 for reasons that I stated five years ago on this
15 exact topic. I don't believe we should outsource our
16 work to a commission of players to be named later,
17 and I think if we want to amend the Charter, we ought
18 to do it here and we do it in every single meeting or
19 virtually every single meeting of this Council, we
20 amend the Charter in various ways so we can do it
21 here. We should do it here. That's what we get paid
22 for. I also vote no on Resos 627 and 630. You're
23 probably tired of hearing why but BIDs are taxes and
24 I don't like to increase taxes on New Yorkers. I'm
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 44

2 not going to do it now. Thank you very much, Madam
3 President.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Zhuang.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Aye on all except
6 Intro. 360-A.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Borelli.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all except
9 360-A.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Farías.

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: I vote aye on
12 all. Congratulations, Council Member Ossé.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Speaker
14 Adams.

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Aye on all.

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: I'd like to
17 recognize Council Member Sanchez.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank You, Madam
19 Leader. I would like to say for the record that my
20 sibling Works at CUNY BMCC. I forget the exact
21 language.

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: That's good.
23 Thank you for stating your disclosure.

24 All items on today's General Order
25 Calendar are adopted by a vote of 50 in the

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 45
2 affirmative, zero and the negative, and zero
3 abstentions with the exception of Intro. 360-A which
4 was adopted by a vote of 42 in the affirmative, 8 and
5 the negative, and zero abstentions, and Introduction
6 1088-A which was adopted by a vote of 49 in the
7 affirmative, 1 in the negative, and zero abstentions,
8 and Resolutions 627 and 630 which was adopted by a
9 vote of 49 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative, and
10 zero abstentions.

11 Introduction and Reading of Bills.

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: All bills have been
13 referred to Committee as indicated on today's Agenda.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you.

15 We will now move into the Discussion of
16 Resolutions, and I would like to recognize Council
17 Member Marmorato.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Thank you,
19 Majority Leader. As I stated during the Veterans
20 Committee, it's a privilege to bring this Resolution
21 forward, one that holds deep significance for me and
22 so many in District 13. Today, we vote to designate
23 March 29th as Vietnam Veterans Day in New York City,
24 a gesture that may seem simple but has a profound
25 meaning for our veterans and their families. The

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

46

2 inspiration for this Resolution came from a
3 conversation with one of my constituents, Oscar Ruiz,
4 at a veterans' breakfast in Morris Park. Oscar shared
5 with me the struggles he and so many Vietnam veterans
6 have faced for years, especially the pain of
7 returning home to a city that did not offer them the
8 recognition or support that they deserved. Hearing
9 his story was a powerful reminder that, as a city, we
10 have the responsibility to do so much better. By
11 designating March 29th as Vietnam Veterans Day, we're
12 making a promise to our Vietnam veterans and their
13 families that their sacrifice, service, and
14 resilience will never be forgotten. This day will
15 serve as a constant reminder that New York City
16 honors them and sees them, values them and their
17 contributions...

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Council Member,
19 your time has expired.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Okay. Thank
21 you. I'd like to thank Regina Paul and my Chief-of-
22 Staff and all of my Council Members that vote yes.
23 Thank you.

24 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: I'd like to
25 recognize Council Member Hanif.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

47

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you. Thank
3 you to Speaker Adams for including Resolution 95 on
4 today's agenda. I also want to thank the 35 sponsors
5 of this Resolution, including co-prime sponsor,
6 Council Member Schulman, and Education Chair Joseph
7 for their support. This Resolution calls on the
8 Department of Education to consult with faith-based
9 organizations to develop and provide all grade levels
10 with the curriculum that focuses on religious
11 diversity. I encourage all my Colleagues to vote in
12 favor of Reso. 95 and for New York City Public
13 Schools to develop and implement this curriculum
14 immediately. Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Seeing no one
16 else signed up to speak, we will now have a voice
17 vote on today's resolutions. If you wish to vote
18 against or abstain from any of today's Resolutions,
19 please notify the Legislative Documents Units by
20 email or by approaching the dais.

21 I'll now read today's Resolutions into
22 the record. Resolution 13 designates the second
23 Friday in March annually as Social and Emotional
24 Learning Day in the City of New York and recognizing
25 the importance of ensuring that pre-kindergarten

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 48

2 through 12th grade public school students acquire the
3 social emotional competencies needed to succeed in
4 life. Will all those in favor say aye?

5 CHAMBERS: Aye.

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: All opposed say
7 nay.

8 CHAMBERS: (SILENT)

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Any abstentions?

10 CHAMBERS: (SILENT) The ayes have it.

11 Resolution 95 calls upon the New York City Department
12 of Education to consult with faith-based
13 organizations to develop and provide all grade levels
14 with curriculum that focuses on religious diversity,
15 to provide professional development focused on the
16 religious diversity for teachers, staff, and
17 administrators, to ensure accurate classification of
18 hate crimes in annual school reports, and immediate
19 notification and fulfilled disclosures to parents of
20 hate crime statistics, and to ensure that schools
21 take actions to condemn bullying and harassment based
22 on religious clothing, food requirements, and the
23 need for prayer space and time year-round. Will all
24 those in favor say aye?

25 CHAMBERS: Aye.

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

49

MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: All opposed say
nay.

CHAMBERS: (SILENT)

MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Any abstentions?

CHAMBERS: (SILENT)

MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: The ayes have it.

Resolution 441 designates March 29 annually as
Vietnam Veterans Day in the City of New York in honor
of the bravery and sacrifice of the Americans who
served and in recognition of the past and present
dedication of their families and caregivers. Will all
those in favor say aye?

CHAMBERS: Aye.

MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: All opposed say
nay.

CHAMBERS: (SILENT)

MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Any abstentions?

CHAMBERS: (SILENT)

MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: The ayes have it.

We will now move into General Discussion, and I'd
like to recognize Council Member Louis followed by
Ariola then Salaam.

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, Majority
Leader. Today, I am proud to introduce Intro. 1107, a

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 50

bill aimed at expanding flexibility for our city's one- and two-family homeowners to provide short-term rentals alongside Speaker Adrienne Adams and Council Members Narcisse and Riley. While we support Local Law 18's goal of safeguarding our housing stock, we must ensure that we are not marginalizing responsible small homeowners. These families are the backbone of our city. These are union workers, service providers, and hard-working individuals. Local law 18 overlooked the reality faced by these homeowners, families who like so many across the city are now in an economic crisis. Rising costs and mortgages coupled with the increase in lack of affordable housing have left them struggling to make ends meet. For many, short-term rental income has become a vital resource to help cover these escalating mortgage costs. In fact, single and two-family homes now account for 66 percent of foreclosures in New York City, with neighborhoods like East Flatbush and Canarsie seeing the highest rates of foreclosure. These homeowners are not large corporations. These are everyday families who live in diverse mixed-income neighborhoods from Crown Heights, Southeast Queens, parts of the Bronx, Harlem, and beyond. These

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

51

2 homeowners pursuing the American dream are being held
3 back by a policy that treats them as if they are
4 commercial enterprises. Intro. 1107 addresses these
5 change these challenges, allowing homeowners to rent
6 out their properties responsibly. We are committed to
7 working collaboratively with the Hotel Association
8 Unions and advocates to ensure this legislation
9 serves the best interests of all New Yorkers. I
10 encourage and urge my Colleagues to support Intro.
11 1107 to keep the American dream alive in our city and
12 to help bring urgently needed relief to those who are
13 struggling to maintain their homes. Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. And
15 just as a friendly reminder for those that are
16 remaining in Chambers, if you are going to leave
17 Chambers, please do so as quietly as possible.

18 I'd like to recognize Council Member
19 Ariola followed by Salaam and Narcisse.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you,
21 Majority Leader. I'd like to talk about Reso. 5. It
22 was discussed yesterday at Dem Conference, and I've
23 had conversation with some of you individually today.
24 I'd like to take a moment to clarify the intent and
25 content of the bill in the legislature that the Reso.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

52

2 5 supports. As all of you know, I've been fighting
3 for the City workers who have been unable to return
4 to work due to inequitable practices of the New York
5 City Law Department. Many City workers who did not
6 take the COVID-19 vaccination were never removed from
7 their jobs, even without reasonable accommodation
8 requests, and others returned when the mandates were
9 lifted without signing any waiver of their civil
10 service rights. There is a remaining group of workers
11 that are not being allowed back to work without
12 signing away their rights. There is no protocol or
13 explanation as to why some were able to return
14 without it and some were not. This is an unfair
15 practice and one that we, as representatives of this
16 City, should not be allowing to continue. Reso. 5
17 supports legislation in Albany, A9196, that would
18 remove this inequity. It would simply allow everyone
19 to return to work in the same manner that others
20 have. It is not an anti-vaccination bill nor is it a
21 bill that is giving the workers any back pay for days
22 they were not working. It would just end the unfair
23 practices of the Law Department and make sure that
24 all workers are being treated equally. I ask you to
25 carefully look over both pieces of legislation and

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

53

2 reach out to me if you have any questions. Please
3 help me right the wrong that thousands of workers are
4 still facing. Do it for firefighter Rashad Taylor,
5 Firefighter Sikhu Abdul, Paramedic Corinne Rosado,
6 and all of the first responders and City workers that
7 just want to return to work, many of whom have
8 testified before this body sharing their hardships.
9 Thank you for the time.

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: I'd like to
11 recognize Council Member Salaam followed by Narcisse
12 and Stevens.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Thank you. Good
14 afternoon, esteemed Members of this great Legislative
15 Body and the honorable Speaker. Today, I'm proud to
16 introduce Resolution number 645 calling on the New
17 York State Legislature to pass and the Governor to
18 sign S182-A/A710, crucial legislation to edn
19 qualified immunity for public officials who violate
20 constitutional rights. First, I want to extend my
21 heartfelt thanks to Senator Robert Jackson and
22 Assembly Member Pamela Hunter who have championed
23 this legislation in the New York State Legislature.
24 Their commitment to justice and accountability is
25 instrumental in advancing this important cause. I

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

54

also want to acknowledge the tireless advocacy of the Innocence Project. Their work has shined a light on the barriers to justice faced by too many and has been vital in the movement to end qualified immunity. As public servants, we are entrusted with the welfare and safety of every New Yorker. Yet, that trust cannot exist without accountability. Qualified immunity has been a barrier for far too long, allowing officials to evade responsibility for actions that harm the very people they are meant to protect. This legislation represents a chance to bridge that gap. It ensures that families and individuals seeking justice have a fair hearing and that no one, regardless of position, is above the law. This Resolution is not merely a policy matter; it is a moral imperative. Our communities deserve to feel safe and to trust that their rights will be upheld without exception. By supporting S182-A/A710, we affirm that public officials must meet the same legal standards as every citizen. This step forward is essential in our fight for a fair, just, and equitable society. Let us work together to build a New York that upholds justice for all. Thank you.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

55

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: I'd like to
3 recognize Council Member Narcisse followed by Stevens
4 and Sanchez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you,
6 Madame Majority, and thank you, Madame Speaker.
7 Colleagues, I urge your support for Intro. 948 and my
8 Colleague Farrah N. Louis, 1107, two bills that
9 address the urgent need for greater housing
10 flexibility and affordability in our city by updating
11 the definition of family in our Building and
12 Administrative Code. Intro. 948 allows single
13 individuals and families to open their homes to up to
14 four borders, roomers, or lodgers. Intro. 1107
15 further enhances housing accessibility by providing
16 additional measure to support affordable housing
17 options to New Yorkers. These measures are small but
18 vital steps toward alleviating housing pressure. I
19 know that firsthand because I have a part of my
20 District that the highest foreclosure. Now, this is
21 for particular communities that's facing rising costs
22 and limited space. This bill helped ensure that our
23 city remains adaptable to the evolving housing needs
24 to New Yorkers. Together, these bills aim to create a
25 more flexible and sustainable housing landscape for

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

56

2 all New Yorkers. I respectfully ask for your support
3 in making this much-needed changes in realty because
4 we know how difficult it is. We heard the bill today
5 that it is hard for our New Yorkers so let's make it
6 possible and let democracy run in this Chamber, too.
7 Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: I'd like to
9 recognize Council Member Stevens followed by Sanchez,
10 Hudson, and Borelli.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: It is my pleasure
12 to introduce legislation alongside Council Member
13 Lee, Intro. 1112, which requires each police precinct
14 in New York City to develop and implement a special
15 needs plan for identifying and responding to
16 individuals with special needs such as Alzheimer's
17 disease, dementia, Down syndrome, and other relating
18 conditions. The precinct plan would include processes
19 to identify individuals with special needs within
20 their communities and establish a precinct-specific
21 respond protocol for interactions with them. As a
22 City, we to recognize the urgent need to address
23 mental health concerns in our community. When it
24 comes to public safety, we should not leave it up to
25 one agency as we are a city with diverse needs. This

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

57

2 legislation aims to foster a safe and more
3 understanding environment for individuals with
4 special needs, prioritizing partnerships between law
5 enforcement, families, healthcare providers and, most
6 importantly, non-profit organizations who are on the
7 front line and doing this work. I invite my
8 Colleagues to sign on to Intro. 1112 as we must
9 continue to take steps forward together to ensure
10 that we create a holistic solution to keep residents
11 safe while providing support and mental health
12 resources for individuals with special needs. Thank
13 you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Recognizing
15 Council Member Sanchez followed by Hudson then
16 Borelli.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you, Madam
18 Leader. Today, I'm proud to introduce with Council
19 Member Hanks, Intro. 1110, which will require the
20 Department of Education to annually report on safe
21 passage routes in place at different NYC schools.
22 Safe passage routes consist of designated walking
23 routes established in coordination with community-
24 based organizations or law enforcement to ensure
25 safety of students who travel to and from school.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

58

2 Violence across New York City is uneven. While some
3 parts of our city can feel like havens, others can
4 feel like war zones. In fact, official NYPD data
5 shows that shootings occur on the same blocks year
6 after year. Just 4 percent of New York City's 120,000
7 blocks account for nearly all of the city's shootings
8 according to this data. As we continue to pursue
9 strategies that make our community safer and make our
10 community members feel safer, 1110 is a tool in the
11 arsenal to protect our youngest. In Chicago, where
12 they've had safe routes and they have analyzed the
13 outcomes of the program because they had good data,
14 which is what 1110 would do for us, schools that had
15 the program for more than two years showed a 20
16 percent decline in violent crime and all crimes
17 overall. I hope my Colleagues would join me in
18 signing on to this legislation so we can receive
19 better data and expand use of safe passage in the
20 communities that need this program.

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member

22 Hudson followed by my Minority Leader Borelli.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you so much.

24 Last session, we made tremendous progress, passing
25 our first Age-in-Place NYC package that included laws

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

59

2 to expand the Right-to-Counsel for older tenants,
3 mandate universal design in City-funded housing, and
4 expand access to telemedicine and culturally
5 appropriate programming at older adult centers. These
6 are major steps toward a more inclusive city that
7 values its older adult population, but the fight
8 isn't over. This session, we're pushing forward with
9 even more critical reforms, stronger coordination
10 across City agencies to support older adults, more
11 options for home-delivered meals, expanded support to
12 keep older adults connected in a digital world, and
13 new tools to help seniors protect themselves from
14 fraud, and we're working on policies that will help
15 lay the groundwork for a comprehensive universal
16 elder care system across all five boroughs. The
17 reality is that we would all be fortunate to age in
18 this great city and aging is a privilege. It's not
19 just our responsibility to support our older adults
20 today but into their future. You can help protect
21 them by signing on to the Age-in-Place 2.0 package.
22 Thank you.

23 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. Now
24 recognizing Minority Leader Borelli.
25

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

60

2 MINORITY LEADER BORELLI: Thank you. I

3 rise today to offer a congratulations to a former New

4 Yorker, President Trump on his reelection. I want to

5 also extend that congratulations to the new Members

6 of our House Delegation, Rep-elect Gillen and Rep-

7 elect Riley. And why do I mention those three?

8 Because all three have committed to trying to end the

9 cap on the SALT Tax, and I think if they can work

10 together on it, certainly, that's a lesson for all of

11 us. I want to also congratulate some New Yorkers who

12 have been asked to be in the Trump Administration.

13 First and foremost is former Rep Lee Zeldin. I'm

14 hopeful that as head of the EPA, he can end the

15 threat from this horrible scam called congestion

16 pricing which proves to do nothing for my community

17 other than to add more congestion and more pollution.

18 Just ask the MTA's own report. I've just found out

19 the Governor intends to reinstate it with a December

20 29th start date and, unfortunately, it's things like

21 this that really validate the criticisms from the

22 biggest cynics of government. When you scrap

23 something before an election and then reimplement it

24 a week later, it really does validate why people hate

25 government just so much. Finally, I'd like to

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

61

2 congratulate Elise Stefanik, the new UN ambassador.

3 She's made the fight against antisemitism one of the

4 foremost things she's done in the House of

5 Representatives. I think the UN can use a voice like

6 that. Actually, last but not least, will give a

7 Congratulations to Steve Witkoff who is going to

8 become the special envoy to the Middle East. Now, as

9 someone who was a real estate developer and the owner

10 of thousands of units here in New York, I think he'd

11 see Mideast peace as sort of a retirement job after

12 dealing with us in the City Council. I don't know

13 about you. I don't think the ayatollah has much on

14 Mr. Restler and his friends. That's a joke. Thank you

15 very much.

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you, and

17 I'll take a moment to recognize and congratulate our

18 Council Member Kalman Yeger for winning his election

19 this November 5th as well.

20 Seeing no one else signed up to speak,

21 I'll now call on Speaker Adrienne Adams to close

22 today's Stated Meeting.

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you. The Stated

24 Meeting of November 13, 2024, is hereby adjourned.

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 15, 2024